



Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

AMERICAN STATISTICAL ASSOCIATION.

NEW SERIES, No. 52.

DECEMBER, 1900.

ADVERTISING IN THE UNITED STATES.

BY SIDNEY A. SHERMAN, PH.D.

Advertising in the United States may be conveniently described under three heads,—the mediums used, the things advertised, and the advertisers and their organization.

THE MEDIUMS USED.

The periodical press overshadows all other mediums of advertising, and is the first to engage our attention. For the last fifty years the daily newspapers have constituted almost exactly ten per cent of the whole number of periodicals. In 1899 they numbered 2128 in a total 21,269. In 1890 their circulation was twelve per cent of the total circulation of the country. Advertising in the daily papers is chiefly local. It consists of the advertisements of retailers, real estate brokers, financial institutions or firms, legal notices, entertainments, and situations or help wanted, besides miscellaneous notices too numerous to be classified. Advertising by outsiders is mainly done by the manufacturers of patent medicines, beverages, and foods, and by the great transportation companies. The amount of this class of advertising in the daily papers is increasing, and the increase is one of the most noticeable tendencies recently apparent.

The great body of periodical publications has always been issued weekly. During the last sixty years weeklies have maintained a pretty steady proportion of the whole number of periodicals in the United States, being 70 per cent in 1840, 75 per cent in 1850, 78 per cent in 1860, 73 per cent in 1870, 76 per cent in 1880, 72 per cent in 1890, and 73 per cent in 1899. A distinguishing feature in the country weekly is the "patent insides and outsides," begun in England as early as 1850, and in this country about 1860. "Plate matter" is another economy of the same nature, the plates instead of the printed papers being sent to the local publisher. In 1880 there were 3232 such weeklies, having an average circulation of 608 each, and in 1899 there were 7600.

Country weeklies stand in the same relation to their communities as the dailies to the cities. They form the sole periodical medium for the local advertiser, and depend largely upon his patronage for their existence. But, as in the case of the dailies, the amount of outside or "foreign" advertising which they carry is increasing.

According to the census of 1890 the sum of \$126,000,000 was invested in the daily and weekly newspapers of the United States in that year. At the present time the sum is probably a half greater. There are now several metropolitan papers valued at not less than \$3,000,000 each. In 1890 more than one hundred thousand persons were employed by the newspapers of the country to whom was paid \$70,000,000 in wages annually.

The newspaper revenue amounted to \$143,000,000 and was about equally derived from the two sources, subscriptions and advertising. In 1867 the estimated receipts from advertising were \$10,000,000; in 1873, \$15,000,000; in 1880, \$39,000,000; and in 1890, \$71,000,000. The gain from 1880 to 1890 was 82 per cent. This ratio has probably increased during the last decade, and the total for the year 1900 will be well on towards the \$150,000,000 mark.

The monthly magazines have been the most striking feature of the press during the last twenty years. From 1880 to 1890 they increased 93 per cent in numbers, which was a much greater percentage than that of the dailies or weeklies. Their average circulation rose from 7834 to 11,317, and here also the increase was more rapid than in the case of the other two classes of periodicals. Since 1890 their increase in numbers has been slow—from 2247 to 2309, but their circulation has grown prodigiously. This has been due to the establishment of the new ten-cent magazines and the great reduction in price of the older ones.

The circulation claimed by the 160 leading monthlies varies from 5000 to 1,250,000, aggregates 25,100,000, and averages about 157,000 each. That is one and a half for every family in the United States. One-half of them claim a circulation of 100,000 or over. Fifty-eight, or about three-eighths of the whole number, are published in the city of New York. Boston has 15, Philadelphia 12, and Chicago 10. Fifteen are published in the state of Maine, and claim a combined circulation of 5,600,000. By the census of 1890 Maine ranked third in the circulation of its monthlies. Needless to say, not all of these are of the highest class, some of them being on the *index expurgatorius* of the Canadian postoffice.

The magazines began to be used for advertising about the time of the Civil War. The first advertisement appeared in the *Atlantic Monthly* in February, 1860, and in *Harper's* in July, 1864. During the last ten or fifteen years this advertising has taken on a new character and increased immensely. The greatest skill in composition is joined with constant improvement in the processes of illustration, so that the advertising pages have become as attractive as the literary portion. It is a commonplace, not much exaggerating the fact, that "everybody reads the advertisements first."

The following table, made up from magazines taken at random, shows the relative amount of advertising and reading matter:—

	<i>Pages Advertising.</i>	<i>Pages Reading.</i>
Century, July, 1889,	68	158
Scribner's, June, 1890,	106	130
Review of Reviews, April, 1895,	71	126
McClure's, November, 1897,	139	96
Century, November, 1898,	102	160
Harper's, October, 1899,	112	168

In none but the *Century* for July, 1889, was the advertising less than half the reading, and the average is five pages of advertisements to seven of reading. Without doubt the thing is being overdone, and there are already indications of a reaction. One of the best monthlies never inserts more than one page of advertisements to two pages of reading.

To illustrate the growth of magazine advertising the following table is given, showing the number of pages of advertisements, and number of advertisements, in *Harper's Magazine*, since their first appearance in it in 1864, taking the month of October wherever a copy of that month's issue was accessible:—

Date.	Pages Ads.	Number Ads.	Date.	Pages Ads.	Number Ads.
1864	3 1-4	11	1885	11 1-2	62
1865	2	5	1886	20	97
1866	3	19	1887	37	135
1867	6	30	1888	54	193
1868	7 1-3	20	1889	48	237
1869	5 1-3	35	1890	75	348
1870	4 1-2	21	1891	113	409
1871	3 1-2	30	1892	90	403
1872	2	20	1893	84	307
1873	1	7	1894	76	353
1874-80	No advertisements.		1895	80	374
1881	Not accessible.		1896	76	329
1882	1 1-4	15	1897	81	348
1883	8 1-2	53	1898	83	330
1884	8	43	1899	112	322
			1900	110	294

Reading matter ranged from 136 pages in the earlier numbers to 168 in 1899. The proportion of advertising was insignificant until after 1885. The effects of hard times on

advertising could have no stronger illustration than the blank years 1874-1880; and it is marked in the years following 1892.¹

While the periodical press may be considered as the main part of the great stream of printed advertising, its volume is swollen by tributary streams, and by occasional and somewhat irregular down-pourings. Of this occasional literature we may distinguish six classes — the almanac, the calendar, the handbill, the circular, the catalogue, and the booklet.

Almanacs, first sent out by insurance companies in England, have long been in use as advertising mediums.² They are especially favored by the patent medicine manufacturers. In St. Louis alone half a dozen of the largest firms send out annually two million almanacs each. The total output of that city is about 20,000,000 yearly.³ But this is put in the shade by the issue of *Ayer's Almanac* in 1898, which is said to have been 25,500,000 copies.

Similar to the almanac in its nature is the calendar, which has had great popularity. Its value lies in the facts that it lasts a long time, is kept in a conspicuous place, and is constantly referred to. The insurance companies are the largest users of calendars, some companies spending as much as \$20,000 a year upon them. Local printers, coal dealers, and other advertisers give them to their customers, and sometimes to all who call for them.

As its name implies, the handbill is given out by hand on the street or at the door. Its use is mainly local, for some special sale of merchandise, for auctions, and for entertainments. It consists of a single leaf printed on one side only. It was formerly much used, and at the closing out of the English lottery in 1826 was distributed by the million. The

¹ For the privilege of using his files of *Harper's* I am indebted to Mr. J. B. Humphreys of Providence. The practice of libraries, and of some publishers, of binding magazines without the advertising pages, is to be deplored; for they are invaluable in the study of social conditions.

² *Every Saturday*, June 6, 1868.

³ A. C. Cantley, *Printers' Ink*, August 17, 1898.

daily newspaper has largely taken its place, and it is consequently much less used in cities than in towns and villages.

A good deal like the handbill in its character is the circular, being used on special occasions, particularly to introduce some new book, a new type of standard article, or as a condensation or selection from a catalogue. The loose "inset" leaf or leaves, so much in vogue in Great Britain, placed in magazines, is properly a circular, since the magazine acts merely to distribute it. Both hand-bill and circular are often simply price lists.

Catalogues are expanded price lists, differing from them in that they are more fully descriptive of the goods advertised. They were originally for distribution among the trade, but have now gone beyond that, and are at present distributed by the million to consumers. The catalogue of one "mail-order" house has over a thousand pages, and contains descriptions of over 75,000 different articles; in another more than 100,000 articles are listed. Numbers of firms selling at wholesale in the cities of Boston, New York, and Chicago have discarded traveling salesmen altogether and are now selling by catalogue.¹ This is a movement the possibilities of which are of the greatest importance in the commercial world.

The booklet is a recent development among the means of advertising. It is generally used either to describe some single article or line of goods, or to describe a factory or process. It is prepared with great attention to style, typography, and illustration. The advertising experts find here a favorite field for the exercise of their abilities. Booklets are at present in great favor among advertisers and the public because of their attractive appearance and the terse style of the English used in them.

Lithographed work has the picture as its chief feature, supplemented by appropriate reading matter. The litho-

¹ *Profitable Advertising*, August 15, 1898, p. 128.

graphs are distributed in packages of goods, and by dealers at the store, or they are hung up in conspicuous places.

Advertising in street, roadside, and field, technically called "outdoor advertising," is carried on by means of store signboards, posters, painted signs, small movable signs, stereopticons, electric signs, and by various devices in air and water.

Signboards on the store are among the oldest and most permanent forms of advertising. It is estimated that there are \$3,000,000 worth of signs in the city of New York alone, and that the brewers of that city furnish the saloons with \$500,000 worth of signs each year. There is a regular craft of sign making.

Posters are of ancient origin. Callades, a Roman artist, is said to have depicted actors in their favorite parts upon the *alba* on the walls at Rome.¹ Posters have always been the special advertising medium of the theatre and other entertainments. P. T. Barnum began their use in this country about 1840, and was soon followed by the other circus managers.² Since the Civil War they have come to be used to advertise goods, and within a few years these "commercial" posters have begun to predominate.

Artistic posters arose in France about 1836.³ Cheret, who is called the father of the modern poster, began his work about 1867, and during the last quarter of a century great attention has been given to the making of posters there. It is said that there are over two hundred artists in Paris engaged in this work. In all Europe and in America there has been a "poster fad." Extensive collections are made by the devotees of the cult. Many exhibitions of posters have been held, local, national, and international. While much of this effort has been abortive, yet it has on the whole appreciably raised the standard of poster making, very markedly so in France, where an inartistic poster is said to be soon torn down.

¹ *Pictorial Posters*, by Charles Hiatt, London, 1895.

² *Printers' Ink*, September 14, 1898.

³ *Pictorial Posters*, by Charles Hiatt, London, 1895.

Billboards, or hoardings, as they are called in England, are the usual means of displaying posters. In the early period of the business it was one in which individual initiative had full scope. The billposter placed his bills where he dared, by day or by night, running his chances of their being torn down by the irate owner or posted over by his competitor. There is now usually one billposter or company in each city, although in the larger cities there are sometimes competitors. There are several general billposters of large capital in the United States who employ an army of men and own space and have facilities for covering any state or number of states. They have brought billposting to a science.¹ A posting machine has recently been invented which can be operated by one man.²

In England there is a "Society of United Billposters" numbering 600 members.³ In America there are state and sectional associations, and also the "Associated Billposters of the United States and Canada." The latter hold an annual meeting, make rules for the regulation of the business, and fix a schedule of prices which depends upon the size of the city in question, the number of sheets in the poster, and the length of time it runs. There are about 700 members in it, and about 3500 in the local associations.⁴ There are two monthly journals, both very creditable in their contents and general tone. Attempts have been made to start a billposting trust, and a corporation was formed with this intent in New Jersey in September, 1899.

Street car advertising has been in existence in the United States about twenty-five years. It has seen a great increase during the last ten years, and is now thoroughly systematized and consolidated in the hands of a few firms which purchase the advertising rights of the street car companies by the year.

¹ Fowler, 764-65.

² *Printers' Ink*, August 23, 1899.

³ *Publicity*, Hull, England, August-September, 1899.

⁴ *Printers' Ink*, August 23, 1899.

The rates vary from one cent a car per day upwards, according to the length of the contract and the number of passengers carried. One of these companies claims to control 14,000 cars in 100 cities; another controls over 4500 cars in 40 cities. A regular system of inspection is maintained by large advertisers to see that the cards are in their places and are not defaced. Steam passenger cars are not used for advertising purposes in the United States. There are, however, special advertising cars, such as those of Montgomery, Ward and Co. of Chicago, and the theatre and circus advance agents. The outside of freight cars has long been used by shippers to display large cards and posters while *en route*. Sometimes a special train is made up by a single large manufacturer, and the whole is made a moving advertisement whose coming is heralded in each city and town through which it is to pass. One large western railroad system has now restricted freight car advertisement to a card or poster not to exceed very moderate dimensions. It is to be hoped that the bewildering maze of cards with which the inside of English railroad stations is plastered will not find its counterpart in the United States.

In retail merchandising, store and window display is second only to the newspaper in its importance as a means of advertising. The spacious and well-lighted store, with convenient floor plan, the systematic and attractive arrangement of goods upon shelves and counters, plainly ticketed with name and price, the general neatness of the clerks and surroundings—all act as a standing invitation to the public to come in and buy. Special displays of the goods in the stores are made at “openings,” held at seasonable times. Crowds throng the store on such occasions.

Window decorating has seen a phenomenal development within a decade or two, especially in the large stores of the cities. It has become a vocation, recognized and well paid by merchants. There are about 1500 men in the United

States who are engaged in it,¹ besides thousands of merchants and clerks who devote a portion of their time to this work. The National Association of Window Trimmers held its first annual meeting at Chicago in August, 1898.² It has members in almost every state. There are two journals exclusively devoted to the subject.

Under the head of personal advertising we shall consider that class of advertising in which the individual person, by his voice, by gestures or other actions, by wearing or carrying the advertisement, or by showing goods which he carries with him, attracts the desired attention. The public crier of ancient days exists only as a relic, but the individual peddlers, crying their own wares, still flourish, and in the United States have largely increased in numbers in recent years. There are the hawkers of fruits and vegetables, so numerous in the summer season; the peddlers of small wares; the soap peddlers and collectors of refuse; the itinerant tradesmen, like scissors grinders and umbrella menders; the venders of quack medicines and novelties who take their stand in the street or public square and advertise their wares by word of mouth; and, finally, newsboys on the streets and in the railroad trains.

Sandwich men, or "banner packers," as they are known to the craft, were common in London fifty years ago,³ and doubtless had existed much earlier. From one to fifty men parade the streets and form a conspicuous advertisement. There are estimated to be from 1000 to 1200 sandwich men in the city of New York alone.

"Demonstrators" have become an important factor in advertising during the last few years. Manufacturers employ them, sending them about from city to city and from fair to fair by schedule, often having a score or more at work continually. Demonstration is for the most part done by young

¹ *The Show Window*, October 10, 1898.

² *Art in Advertising*, September, 1898.

³ *Dublin Review*, September, 1849.

women. A school has been established in Boston which teaches and finds places for demonstrators, for whom, if capable, there is an active demand among the large advertising firms.¹ It is estimated that there are now 10,000 demonstrators in the United States.²

Commercial travelers have a double function, advertising and selling. The proportion in which the two are combined varies in different businesses, according to the amount of advertising done in other ways. The tendency is, as far as possible, to substitute printed matter for the oral representations of the commercial traveler, and to sell by means of order blanks sent with trunks of samples, or by illustrated catalogues. In 1898 there were 28 large houses in New York, 17 in Boston, 21 in Chicago, and many in other cities which had discarded "drummers" altogether and sold only by catalogue.³

The Commercial Travelers' National League is a strong general organization, besides which there are numerous organizations by localities and by lines of goods. The census of 1890 returned 58,691 persons engaged in the business. The president of the league, in his testimony before the Industrial Commission, June 16, 1899, stated that those figures were grossly incorrect, and that in 1899 there were 350,000.

The means of advertising all resolve themselves into two classes, in the first of which the goods themselves are placed before the potential buyer, and in the second a representation of the goods is made. Under the first head come store and window display, most "personal" advertising (*e. g.*, demonstrators and commercial travelers) and the distribution of samples at the house and at fairs. This method is most primitive, and has its types in the fairs, markets, and traveling packmen that have existed from early times. Naturally oral description goes with it. Written description was next

¹ *Printers' Ink*, "Boston Correspondence," October 19, 1898.

² F. A. Heywood in *Printers' Ink*, July 12, 1899.

³ *Profitable Advertising*, August 15, 1898.

in development, but did not go far until the art of printing was perfected. Pictures have always been used in a rude way, but not advantageously or effectively until recent years.

Of all the mediums described the periodical press easily stands first in importance. Store and window display is doubtless a better means, for both buyer and seller, but it is limited in its application. The printed page goes everywhere and at a minimum of cost.

THE THINGS ADVERTISED.

We shall now view our subject from another standpoint—the nature of the things advertised. Raw materials and unfinished products do not play a conspicuous part in advertising. The reason appears to be that they are generally produced and sold by the many but bought and used by the few, and advertising exists only where the many buy and use.

The means of transportation have long been advertised. The first stage coach notices in England appeared in the year 1658, almost two centuries and a half ago. Until recent years this advertising has been done in the form of notices of the departure and arrival of stage coaches and other vehicles, of vessels for domestic and foreign ports, and railroad time tables. Shipping notices were numerous in the American papers of the 18th century; and they have always been a feature of the first page of *The Times* in London.

Today, in addition to the mere statement of fact of the time-table type, we find railroad and steamship lines using all the mediums and devices known in order to attract passengers, and often adopting those general and far-reaching methods which are indirect and distant in their results.

A certain great system prints in newspapers sketches of its line by well-known literary men. When a paper prints a good description of a town on the line the company buys hundreds or thousands of extra copies. Every year one or

more press associations travel over the line as its guests. The company publishes a monthly paper of which 50,000 copies are sent to possible buyers of land. It also issues books of farming, summer resorts, and shooting and fishing. It uses lithographs, posters and hangers where people are illiterate or papers few. Photographs of landscapes, industrial enterprises, and people are prominent in its advertising. It has sent a company of entertainers and a biograph show through parts of the country; fox hunts and conventions of settlers and insurance agents are other features.

Industrial agents in every town along the line answer inquiries concerning their locality, and induce owners of property near the road to keep it neat and attractive. The station agents beautify the stations and their surroundings, grass plots and flower beds being carefully cultivated. Circulating library cars visit each town once a month, and an industrial train in spring and fall, when lectures on soils, planting, etc., are given, improved implements are shown, and demonstrations in canning are given. By these indirect means, far reaching in their nature, and the more powerful as they are remote from the end in view, do the great railroad lines make themselves known to multitudes of people. The volume of freight advertising is much less than that of passenger advertising. The reason for this is the fact that freight traffic is incapable of that stimulation to which passenger traffic, involving personal gratification and luxury to so large a degree, is susceptible.

Finished products, or "consumer's goods," are the subjects of the great bulk of advertising. Among foods the advertisements of canned fruits and vegetables and pickles and preserves of all sorts are very prominent in the magazines and street cars, and on posters and painted signs. A well-known sauce firm contracted in April, 1899, to have five hundred and seventy cities in the United States posted for three months with an "eight-sheet" poster advertising a

single product; the cost was \$50,000.¹ Another pickle, sauce, and preserve firm, whose factories and warehouses cover 23 acres, employs 272 traveling salesmen and many demonstrators, and uses millions of lithographed cards, hangers, calendars, etc., and an immense amount of street car space. Its operations extend over all English speaking countries on the globe and all Latin America besides. It made an extensive exhibit at Paris, distributing several million samples.²

Cereal foods are widely advertised. Several companies spend in the region of \$500,000 a year each, and their products have become household words. Some of them are international advertisers on a great scale. Cooked cereal foods have also entered the field. The latest and greatest advertising exploit in this line is that of the National Biscuit Company; \$100,000 worth of advertising was contracted for, mainly in newspapers and posters. It began in January, 1899, and in a few weeks the factories were 480,000 orders behind, and the company was compelled to stop advertising for a time in order to catch up.³

Tea, coffee, and cocoa have been advertised in England for two centuries and a half, they being among the earliest merchandise to be offered for sale in the newspapers. The leading tea dealer has become an international character through his tea advertising, which extends over all English speaking countries. Others are scarcely less widely known. Coffee has recently been advertised on a larger scale than ever before in the United States, partly because of the competition of the various substitutes, but more because of the contest between rival producers. Cocoa and chocolate manufacturers are among the most extensive of all advertisers. French, Dutch, English, and American brands rival each other in their claims to public attention. Numerous preparations of cereals as substitutes for coffee have been placed

¹ *Printers' Ink*, April, 1899.

² *Ibid.*, November, 1898, p. 22.

³ *Western Advertiser*, July, 1899.

upon the market during the last fifteen years, and a few of them, advertised on a national scale, seem destined to be more than temporary. One at least is reckoned among the largest advertisers in the country.

Baking powder has long been prominent in all mediums of advertising. Intense rivalry existed among the baking powder companies for many years, accompanied by a most extraordinary amount of advertising. Now that the large companies have combined the advertising continues without much abatement. The great trade in certain brands was built up by long advertising, and in order to maintain these brands in their position that advertising must go on. The Royal Baking Powder Company is said to have spent \$800,000 a year.¹ What the combined companies spend it is too early to ascertain. The business is of international extent. They use "practically every newspaper in the world." In Mexico one brand has been so well advertised that its name is a synonym for baking powder.² It was one of the pioneers in international advertising.

Liquors and tobacco, appealing to the appetites, being of general use, and of great variety as to kind, quality and form, offer one of the most favorable subjects of advertising. The advertising of beer has grown with great rapidity, as it is a relatively new beverage in America. Several companies rank among the most extensive advertisers in the world, for they operate on an international scale. At least one of them spends \$500,000 a year.

Tobacco, being in more general use than liquors, offers an even wider field; and being less under legal and moral ban, its public advertisement is more extensive and more general than that of liquors. With the growth of large manufacturing companies, each pushing its own brand of cigars, cigarettes, and tobacco, the advertising increased rapidly.

¹ C. A. Bates, "Short Talks on Advertising."

² *Printers' Ink*, August 9, 1899, from *Mexican Herald*.

The formation of the American Tobacco Company does not appear to have much diminished the amount, if at all. This may be partly owing to the existence of very large and powerful competitors outside the trust, but far more, without doubt, to the necessity of keeping the names of established brands before the public. Moreover, the company has had success far beyond its expectations with certain new brands of cigars which it has advertised extensively, and is now going forward in this line on a great scale. It is said to have appropriated \$600,000 for advertising cigars alone in 1900.¹ During 1899 the advertisement of a single brand of cigars appeared on the billboards of every city and town in the United States for three months at a cost of \$300,000.²

No department of advertising presents such interesting phenomena as that of patent medicines. Of the history of modern advertising since its beginning in England in the time of the Commonwealth, medicinal advertising may well say *quorum magna pars fui*. Beginning with its beginning, growing with its growth, medicines have remained its most constant factor, and today the largest advertisers in the world are patent and proprietary medicine makers. One of them is reputed to be spending \$1,250,000 a year in newspaper advertising alone. His order for albums for 1899 was seven million copies.³ The next largest firm spends upwards of a million a year. They advertise in all the principal countries on the globe. All Europe, North and South America, Asia, Africa, and the islands of the sea are invaded by them. They have a factory in the city of Mexico and one in Cuba. They advertise in practically every newspaper in the Central and South American countries, besides which they themselves publish a newspaper in each country and send it to sections in which the local newspapers are not well distributed.

¹ *Profitable Advertising*, September, 1899.

² *Profitable Advertising*, August, 1899.

³ *Publicity*, May, 1899.

Millions of cards are also distributed by them annually in these countries.¹

A considerable number of companies spend half a million a year. The general manager of one of them thus describes the way in which his company's appropriation was to be divided in 1899: "About \$300,000 will be spent with the daily and weekly newspapers; about \$50,000 with magazines and illustrated weeklies; about \$50,000 with medical journals and other scientific and semi-scientific publications; about \$50,000 in signs, billposting, and the like; and about \$50,000 in the distribution of lithographic pamphlets, circulars, etc. It will cover all the large cities of the United States, Canada, Great Britain, and some smaller countries."²

About one-third of the total sales of retail druggists is made up of medicine.³ Of 2583 general advertisers using the magazines and general weeklies, and tabulated by *Press and Printer* from January 1st to October 29, 1898, one-sixth of the whole number, 425, were makers of proprietary articles. Of 74 pages of advertising in the *Strand Magazine* for Christmas, 1898, patent medicines and remedies occupied 32 pages.⁴ They occupy a large fraction of the space in the dailies taken by "foreign" (that is, not local) advertisers. Thus, 13 out of 23 "foreign" advertisements in the *Providence Journal* for January 26, 1900, were of this class.

One of its peculiar features is the publication of testimonials. Every large company accumulates thousands of them, which it publishes widely. The *New York Sunday Herald* for April 16, 1899, contained six pages of testimonials to the merits of a single medicine, and the *Journal* contained five pages. This was overwhelming in its magnitude, and is probably without parallel. The cost of the two was \$9000.⁵ Testimonials from prominent people are

¹ *Printers' Ink*, February 22, 1899, quoting *Advertising Experience*.

² *Profitable Advertising*, April, 1899, pp. 606-07.

³ *Printers' Ink*, July 19, 1899.

⁴ *Publicity*, January-February, 1899.

⁵ *Printers' Ink*, May 3, 1899.

much sought and, it would appear, easily obtained, generally for a consideration. Men holding political positions and the owners of professional titles are apparently not averse to turning an honest penny in this way.

The free distribution of samples is another method much used by the patent medicine makers. It has given rise to a host of distributors, general and special, all over the country.

There are over two hundred soap concerns of fair size in the United States, a dozen of which are large advertisers, as are several English firms. There has been keen competition among them, resulting in the adoption of many schemes and devices to sell their goods. They are large users of lithographs, painted signs, tacked signs, picture cards, etc. One plan has been to give a sum of money to every church, philanthropic society, and the like, which collected a given number of coupons to be found only in the packages of soap. One company gives an article of furniture with every order for soap of a certain amount. Its sales are chiefly by mail.

A Chicago firm is stated to have contracted for \$200,000 worth of advertising in western newspapers alone in 1899.¹ Several others spend from \$300,000 to \$500,000 a year,² and *Pears'* must be near the million mark. Many millions altogether are expended every year for soap advertising. In the summer of 1899, when the attempt was being made to form a trust, it was stated in the public prints by the promoters that \$30,000,000 a year was thrown away by the soap manufacturers in this way. The amount was exaggerated, but one-half that sum would probably be within bounds.

Toilet articles appeal especially to women. They are advertised in the monthly and weekly periodicals, particularly women's papers, on the billboards, and in the street cars. The annual expenditure of one concern is \$150,000 a year;³ that of another is estimated at \$200,000.⁴

¹ *Printers' Ink*, June 28, 1899.

² *Printers' Ink*, March 1, 1899, citing *The Advertising Man*.

³ *Ibid.*, May 17, 1899.

⁴ *Ibid.*, March 1, 1899.

Much general advertising of clothing has sprung up in recent years. Shoes are being especially exploited at the present time. A full back cover advertisement of a shoe for women recently appeared in a popular monthly at a cost of \$4000 for the single issue. One of the best known advertisement writers expended \$100,000 in advertising a certain shoe leather.¹ The manufacturers of a new shoe have contracted with an advertising agency to spend \$50,000 a year for ten years in newspapers and trade journals to push the shoe in the United States and foreign countries.² In August, 1899, the advertisement of a well-known shoe began to appear in 7750 papers supposed to reach about 25,000,000 people in this country.

The general advertising of undergarments was begun about twenty years ago by a single firm acting as concessionaries of a German house. In a few years rivals sprang up, and today there are many advertisers of these goods of both foreign and domestic make. In *McClure's Magazine* for November, 1897, eight different ones appeared. The general advertising of men's clothing began about fifteen years ago. From 1889 to 1892 it was carried on on a large scale by one firm which expended from \$75,000 to \$80,000 a year. Since then men's suits and overcoats have become widely advertised by houses devoted to that line of goods, and by the mail order houses. A large wholesale hat firm in New York sells to retailers by means of circulars containing half tones of their various styles of hats. The retailers order from the circulars, and thus the firm saves the cost of the commercial travelers formerly employed. It claims to make a net saving of \$18,000 a year by this means.

Among household implements sewing machines are advertised on a gigantic scale. They are used in the factory as well as in the home, but are preëminently a domestic imple-

¹ *Profitable Advertising*, October, 1899.

² *Ibid.*, April, 1899.

ment. One company sells 800,000 machines a year through its agencies in every city in the entire civilized world, employing 50,000 canvassers.¹ For a long time the company printed a monthly paper of its own — 1,000,000 each issue — and was a liberal patron of lithographing. It exhibits at all the great expositions, and uses almost every kind of newspaper, but its greatest advertising medium is the 50,000 canvassers. There are few if any instances in general merchandising in which the personal medium counts for more. The advertising outlay of this company is the largest in the world, amounting to several millions annually.

Fuel is not largely advertised, as the coal producers are to all intents and purposes a trust, agreeing together upon output and prices. Local dealers advertise to a moderate degree, and there are occasional examples of extensive local advertising.

Gas and electric lighting companies have as yet advertised but little, being generally secure in their monopolies, but already some of them are beginning to see that by advertising they can increase their business and profits, and are acting accordingly. A notable instance is that of the gas company in Philadelphia.

We now pass from those things which satisfy the primary needs for food, clothing, shelter, and care of the body, to articles used for recreation, and to satisfy the artistic and intellectual sides of human nature.

During the last decade vast sums have been spent in advertising the bicycle. Since 1889, when they first appeared there, the average number of bicycle advertisements in *Harper's Magazine* has been 6; in 1896, when the height was reached, there were 15. Every class of periodical is used, as well as the other means of advertising. Racing teams are a striking feature. In 1894 one firm spent \$20,000 in selling 5000 bicycles; in 1895, over \$75,000 to sell 20,000; and in 1896,

¹ *Printers' Ink*, June 14, 1899.

\$145,000 to sell 40,000. Of the last, \$10,000 was for catalogue, and \$10,000 for racing team.¹

Of the 2583 advertisements classified by *Press and Printer*, 266, or a little over ten per cent, belonged in the category of art products. These articles appear mainly in the magazines and weeklies. The advertising of silverware, musical instruments, and cameras is most prominent, there being numbers of firms of national reputation advertising in the standard papers, besides many which make a specialty of goods which are sold through the medium of the mail order journals.

For some years cameras have been quite widely advertised in the general mediums of all grades. In *Harper's Magazine* they were first advertised in 1884, and reached their height in 1889. The largest company now in existence, started in 1888, is capitalized at \$5,000,000, and is estimated to spend about \$750,000 a year in advertising.² This company gives prizes for pictures taken with its cameras. One year it held two exhibitions, one in New York and one in London, at a cost of \$50,000. The name and catch phrase coined by this company have become a part of the vernacular.

Books, periodicals, and writing materials form about 15 per cent of the advertisements classified by *Press and Printer*, and the three were almost exactly equal in numbers, being 130, 128, and 124, respectively. For mediums by which to reach the public they are pretty closely limited to the magazines and general weeklies.

Books formerly depended very largely upon the personal medium for their advertising,—that is, upon agents and solicitors. Many well-known standard works of reference, as well as multitudes of cheaper and often worthless books, have been sold in this way. For the higher class of books, however, the day of the agent is passed, and his work is mainly done by the press.

¹ Fowler's *Publicity*, p. 171.

² *The Advertising Man*, cited in *Printers' Ink*, July 26, 1899.

The general advertising of periodicals is increasing, especially with the competition among the popular monthlies and weeklies. The *Ladies' Home Journal* and the *Saturday Evening Post* have probably been more extensively advertised than any periodicals in this country. The only paper to be compared with them in this respect is Robert Bonner's *Ledger*, forty years ago. The extent of his advertising was then without precedent; whole pages of daily newspapers were used by him to blazon forth the merits of the *Ledger*.¹ One such advertisement—probably the “Fanny Fern writes for the *Ledger* only”—cost him \$60,000.²

Newspapers advertise themselves indirectly by connecting their names with some great undertaking, as the *Times* did in the exposure of the Tweed Ring in New York, and the *Herald* by sending Stanley to Africa to find Livingstone.

Certain makers of pens, ink, and paper are large advertisers, and have been so for many years. Fountain pens, perfected in recent years, appear in all general mediums, and the manufacturers of one of them, at least, must spend \$50,000 a year in advertising it. But the advertising of the typewriter is the largest of all and ranks with that of the bicycle and the camera in its extent. It first appeared in *Harper's Magazine* in 1885, and reached its height in 1895, since which time it has somewhat fallen off. Since 1890 there have been from eight to fourteen different advertisements of this article in each number.

THE ORGANIZATION OF ADVERTISING.

We now pass to the active agents in advertising and their organization.

The advertiser is the central figure. There are all grades, from the hawker, who makes use of his own voice in crying directly to the public the wares which he carries in his pack,

¹ Philadelphia Bulletin, cited in *Printers' Ink*, August 16, 1899.

² Bates' Advertiser's Guide Book, September, 1884.

up to the executive of a great corporation with factories in several countries and storehouses of goods dotting the globe, who calls to his aid a dozen different agencies directly or indirectly connected with the desired end. The latter is the modern type.

In October, 1898, there were 2583 general advertisers making use of American periodicals.¹ This number does not include the insignificant concerns that use two or three lines in the cheaper publications, but the larger and more reputable ones. Probably there are nearly or quite 3000 in 1900.

Their geographical distribution is shown by the following table:—

Maine	21	Virginia }	10
New Hampshire	15	West Virginia }	
Vermont	12	North Carolina }	3
Massachusetts	364	South Carolina }	
Rhode Island	23	Georgia	5
Connecticut	88	Florida	6
New York	863	Alabama	0
New Jersey	49	Mississippi	0
Pennsylvania	187	Louisiana	4
Delaware	3	Texas	4
Maryland	12	Arkansas	0
District of Columbia	16	Oklahoma	0
Ohio	189	Tennessee	6
Indiana	43	Kentucky	8
Illinois	367	Wyoming	0
Michigan	104	Idaho	0
Wisconsin	52	Montana	0
Minnesota	25	Utah	0
Iowa	16	New Mexico	0
Missouri	36	Arizona	0
Kansas	4	Nevada	0
Nebraska	6	California	16
North Dakota }	0	Oregon	0
South Dakota }		Washington	13
Colorado	7	Canada	6

Sixteen hundred twenty-two, or 63 per cent, were in the New England states, New York, New Jersey, and Pennsylvania. New York alone had 863, or 33½ per cent. Two thousand three hundred seventy-seven, or 92 per cent of the

¹ *Press and Printer*, October 29, 1898.

whole, were north of the Ohio and Mason and Dixon's line, and east of the Mississippi.

The twenty largest cities had the following numbers:—

New York	664	Philadelphia	130
Boston	243	San Francisco	8
Cleveland	24	New Orleans	3
Washington	16	Milwaukee	26
Minneapolis	13	Louisville	4
Chicago	308	St. Louis	26
Baltimore	10	Cincinnati	67
Buffalo	18	Pittsburg	16
Detroit	27	Newark	10
Jersey City	7	Omaha	3

New York, with 664, has 26 per cent of the whole; and together with Boston and Chicago has 1215, or over 48 per cent of the whole. Nothing could more strikingly show the concentration of business in the great centers.

Local advertisers are of course vastly more numerous than general advertisers. From the figures for a single city an estimate for the whole country can be made. From Bradstreet's and Dun's an estimate of the number of business firms can be formed, and from this some approximation to the number of advertisers obtained. One authority says that there are seventeen in every thousand of the population, or over a million in all; another says five hundred thousand, excluding the transient wants, and that two-thirds of them are constant. The latter seems to be within bounds; it would be an average of about twenty-three different advertisers in each of the 22,000 periodicals in the country. From the number of general advertisers already given it will be seen how vast a majority of all are local.

While the great majority of business men write their own advertisements the tendency is, as business grows in extent and complexity, to employ a skilled man to prepare them. During the last fifteen years this art has developed rapidly, furnishing a new calling for hundreds of men and women. The best of them are paid from \$5000 to \$25,000 a year.

ADVERTISEMENTS IN HARPER'S MAGAZINE

	Dec. 1864.	Oct. 1865.	Nov. 1866.	Oct. 1867.	Sept. 1868.	Oct. 1869.	Oct. 1870.	Oct. 1871.	Oct. 1872.	Oct. 1873.	1874.	1880.	1881.	Nov. 1882.	Oct. 1883.	
Agents wanted.....	5	..	2	3	1	No advertisements appeared from 1874 to 1880.			3	4	
Architects plans.....	1	1	
Art goods, silverware, etc.....	2	1	4	3	2	..	1	1	3
Bicycles.....
Books and publications.....	..	1	4	7	2	5	3	2	..	1				..	1	5
Building material.....	1	1	1	..	1	1
Cameras.....
Clothing.....	1	..	2	..	1	1	1	1	2
Educational.....	2	5
Financial.....	2	1	1
Food.....	1	1	2	1	1
Games.....
Hotels and resorts.....
House furnishings.....	2	1	4	5	3	10	4	5	1	1	6
Liquors and tobacco.....
Live stock.....	1	1
Machinery and tools.....
Medical and proprietary.....	4	2	3	7	4	5	1	2	4	3				4
Miscellaneous.....	3	7	1	1				2	..	5
Music and musical instruments.....	2	..	3	1	1	1	3	1	1	1				1	..	3
Office furniture and supplies.....	..	1	2	1	1	..
Railroad and steamship lines.....	2
Real estate.....
Seeds and plants.....	1	..	2	1	5	4	3	..
Soaps and toilet articles.....	1	1	1	1	5	1	1	4
Sporting goods.....
Typewriters.....
Vehicles.....
Writing materials.....	1	5	1	5
Total number of advertisements	11	5	21	30	20	35	21	30	20	7					15	52
Total pages of ads.....	3 $\frac{1}{4}$	2	3	6	7 $\frac{1}{2}$	5 $\frac{1}{2}$	4 $\frac{1}{2}$	3 $\frac{1}{2}$	2	1					1 $\frac{1}{4}$	8 $\frac{1}{2}$
Illustrated advertisements.....	5	1	4	7	6	9	7	8	7	3				

Previous to 1886 there were 1 to 5 full-page advertisements in each issue. In 1888 there were 10 full-page advertisements, 1 two-page, and 1 four-page; in 1891, 21 full-page, 1 two-page, and 2 four-page; in 1899, 34 full page, 6 two-page, 1 three-page, and 1 four-page.

There have always been 5 to 21 pages — usually 12 — of the Harper's own announcements.

Blue-print cuts were used in 1890 only. Half-tones first appeared in 1891. Harper's announcements began to occupy the front page in 1892. Reading matter has ranged from 136 to 168 pages.

ARPER'S MAGAZINE FROM 1864 TO 1900.

	Nov. 1882.	Oct. 1883.	Oct. 1884.	Oct. 1885.	Oct. 1886.	Oct. 1887.	Oct. 1888.	Aug. 1889.	Oct. 1890.	Nov. 1891.	Oct. 1892.	Oct. 1893.	Oct. 1894.	Oct. 1895.	Oct. 1896.	Oct. 1897.	Oct. 1898.	Oct. 1899.	Oct. 1900.
	3	4	2	..	1	4	3	1	2	1	1	1	1	1
	..	1	2	1	1	1	2	7	3	4	1	2	2	2	1
	1	3	3	3	..	4	3	5	5	23	28	32	20	22	9	12	13	14	3
	4	4	5	7	6	2	8	15	7	..	2	..
	1	5	1	6	11	8	12	11	16	42	11	20	14	11	15	22	16	7	29
	3	3	1	..	11	5	8	15	23	24	18	24	19	19	14	15	5
	1	..	1	3	4	8	5	7	..	4	4	6	4	2	5	4	3
	1	2	..	2	5	9	16	19	23	36	32	9	19	13	14	22	26	24	17
	..	5	3	7	10	15	11	52	73	45	94	55	106	131	123	123	119	113	93
	..	1	..	2	6	4	6	10	11	15	11	8	7	7	6	5	4	5	7
	..	1	3	3	9	12	12	12	17	21	17	22	17	15	15	16	15	23	22
	1	4	5	4	4	4	7	1	3	4	3	2
	6	2	2	2	2	4	5	1	1
	1	6	1	5	8	17	13	27	51	45	26	19	30	10	12	11	16	12	17
	1	2	1	..	1	..	3	3	3	3	2	3	4	7	4
	4	3	1	1	1	1	1
	6	6	10	5	3	2	5	2	4	2	3	4
	..	4	4	4	15	21	17	24	30	40	29	12	27	27	29	27	22	18	16
	2	5	..	3	2	2	3	2	11	5	24	18	20	19	11	10	8	15	8
	1	3	5	3	1	2	6	8	13	16	18	10	7	7	7	10	10	11	7
	1	3	4	3	1	7	10	4	7	6	9	5	3	4	4	4
	..	2	..	1	2	2	..	2	2	2	3	4	3	2	3	6	7	8	12
	4	1	3	1
	3	..	2	1	1	1	3	4	9	4	11	5	6	3	2	4	3	1	..
	1	4	6	10	9	14	16	11	14	38	11	12	14	16	14	15	16	16	15
	1	1	6	1	5	3	4	..	2	..	2	4	..	1	..
	1	2	5	5	7	11	9	11	13	8	14	9	9	10	8	9
	1	2	2	5	4	3	3	5	2	2	2	3	7
	..	5	4	6	7	6	11	11	7	4	8	5	4	5	5	4	3	7	7
	15	52	43	62	97	135	193	237	348	409	403	307	353	374	329	348	330	322	294
	11 $\frac{1}{4}$	8 $\frac{1}{2}$	8	11 $\frac{1}{2}$	20	37	54	48	75	113	90	84	76	80	76	81	83	112	110
	44	89	..	123	..	250	166	..	129

only. Half-tones first appeared about 1895.

occupy the front pages in 1883; school and college advertisements in 1889; and commercial advertisements in 1890.

136 to 168 pages.

There are others who prepare advertisements to order. They will also plan a whole advertising campaign for those whose business is not large enough to employ one writer exclusively. Even here the principle of division of labor asserts itself, and some are found devoting themselves to one line of writing, as in the drug business, for example.

At least two schools of advertising have been established. One is in Chicago, conducted by two experienced writers, and its curriculum includes ninety-eight divisions of study grouped under the following headings: Essays; Illustrating and Engraving; General Advertising; Local Advertising; Making and Displaying; "Adwriting"; Mail Order Advertising; Outdoor Publicity; Printing and Lithography; and Special Sales and Openings.¹ The other school is in Indiana.² Both give instruction by mail as well as at the school. Besides these regular schools the columns of the metropolitan dailies occasionally contain an offer by an experienced advertisement writer to teach the art to individuals.

While these enterprises encounter a good deal of contempt and even opposition, it would seem that, conducted in a practical way, they ought to find a field of work. Systematized knowledge and experience, obtained under intelligent guidance, are acquired more rapidly and to better advantage every way than by individuals haphazard and alone, provided that the pupils are desirous of obtaining them.

In conclusion it may be said about the advertisement writer that it was the general agreement among the two hundred and fifty large advertisers represented in Fowler's *Publicity* that an expert was necessary for their success.

Closely related to the class of advertisement writers, and in fact merging into them, are the advertising agents, whose function it is to act as an intermediary between the advertiser and the newspaper or other medium. The earliest agent in America is said to have been Orlando Bourne, who

¹ H. B. Howard, in *Printers' Ink*, May 24, 1899.

² L. D. Sampson, in *Printers' Ink*, June 7, 1899.

began business in New York in 1828. In 1841 Volney B. Palmer established himself in the same city,¹ and the next year John W. Hooper and Co.² Palmer soon branched out to Boston and Philadelphia. Other firms were established in course of time, and at the present day every large city has several. New York has always been the center, and in 1871 one-half the agents were in the *Times* building in that city and did nine-tenths of the annual business of the country.³

Among large concerns the tendency is to have an advertising manager who takes charge of that side of the business, planning the campaign, furnishing the main ideas to be worked out by his assistants, and placing the advertisements direct, without the intervention of outside agents. However, the agents still handle about three-fourths of all the general advertising done.⁴ The tendency to specialization manifests itself among the agencies in that certain ones devote themselves to work with mediums of a particular class. There are two in New York whose special field is the trade journals. At the other end of the line are the so-called "special agents," representing one or more publications and soliciting business from the advertisers. Chicago and New York are the centers of this business, the former city having an organization, the Agate Club, whose object is to develop advertisers in the West.⁵

Of the periodical press, which is the main reliance of the great majority of advertisers, we have already spoken. For information concerning it, outside of its own locality, the advertiser depends upon the directories published by the agencies. The two oldest and most comprehensive are *The American Newspaper Directory*, established in 1869, and *Ayer's American Newspaper Annual*. They are bulky volumes of thirteen to fifteen hundred pages each, containing

¹ Palmer's "Rules and Hints for Advertising."

² Rowell's *Advertiser's Gazette*, January, 1871.

³ *Ibid.*

⁴ Fowler's *Publicity*, p. 352.

⁵ *Advertising Experience*, August, 1898.

lists of papers in the towns and cities of each state, arranged alphabetically, and giving the size, frequency of issue, rates, circulation, publisher's name, and other data. They also give lists of the different classes of papers, as of dailies, religious weeklies, and agricultural papers.

Thirty-five years ago no complete list was published. A few large advertisers had compiled their own, which they jealously guarded, and the agencies had them and treasured them as their most valuable possessions. The number of papers in the first directory in 1869 was 5000; those for 1899 contained over 21,000.

Engaged in the distribution of periodicals there are 3600 people in the United States who are exclusively newsdealers; and 10,000 who are "booksellers, newsdealers, and stationers" in the United States and Canada.¹ The agency of the American News Company in the cheap and expeditious distribution of periodicals is of the highest importance. Beginning in a small way in New York in 1864 it afterwards established branches in other cities. Meanwhile different companies had been formed in New York, Philadelphia, and Chicago, but they were eventually all combined with it to form the greater company.² The branches generally retain a local name, as the New England News Company of Boston and the Central of Philadelphia do, but they are simply parts of the one main company. The company distributes 2000 American newspapers and periodicals, more than 500 English, 100 French, 80 German, and a smaller number of other publications. Its yearly business is about \$15,000,000.³ It is an indispensable convenience to hundreds of publishers in that it buys their whole editions outside of what is mailed to regular direct subscribers; the edition is off their hands and paid for the moment it leaves their doors. It effects an immense saving by putting into one package all the different

¹ Trow's Addressing Co., cited in *Printers' Ink*, July 5, 1899.

² *Art in Advertising*, cited in *Printers' Ink*, March 15, 1899.

³ *Mail Orders*, cited in *Printers' Ink*, July 26, 1899.

publications destined for one dealer in a village or city and systematizing the whole work. Needless to say, it wields almost despotic power over the destinies of the publishing houses, especially the newer and weaker ones, since it is practically impossible for a periodical to be distributed without its assistance.

Newspapers and periodicals for the railroad trade are distributed by the Union News Company, which is the railroad branch of the main company.

If the advertiser sends out circulars, catalogues, etc., a list of addresses is necessary. These he obtains from the "letter brokers" and owners of address lists at so much per thousand. He can obtain lists of any class of people, of any occupation or degree of wealth, in any city, locality, or state. If he so desires, the addressing companies will furnish addressed envelopes or wrappers, fold and enclose the circular, and print the "return card" on the envelope, relieving him of all care in the matter. The address lists are obtained from letters written to publishers and advertisers, from local and trade directories, the commercial agency books, and the newspapers,—the latter through the "press clipping bureaus."

The clipping bureaus make a business of reading all sorts of publications for all sorts of purposes. Originally they worked for musicians and other public performers who wished to collect press comments and notices of themselves, but now the scope of their work is unlimited. They chronicle births, marriages, deaths, casualties, and sicknesses from the daily and weekly papers for the benefit of makers of infants' foods, dealers in duplicate wedding presents, monument makers, artificial leg makers, etc. Projects for bridge and factory building and for all kinds of construction are noted for the use of builders and dealers in building material. Today there are bureaus in all the large cities of the country. One has branches in several cities, and still another, which claims to

be the original one, has offices in the European capitals, Sydney, the city of Mexico, and New York. To illustrate the magnitude of the business it may be stated that a Chicago bureau prints a list of over 3500 dailies and weeklies and 110 magazines which it reads and clips. Another claims to clip 15,000 copies of papers every week and send out 10,000 items daily. A third clips 10,000 copies a week and employs fifty people. The labor is minutely sub-divided, one set of workers reading and marking, and others clipping, pasting, sorting, etc. There are about twenty bureaus in the country, with a total of about three hundred employees.

The advertiser may desire a house-to-house distribution of his printed matter or samples. If so he employs the professional distributor, whose business, fast becoming highly organized, has been sufficiently described already. The tendency towards consolidation is also marked among the bill-posters and street car advertising agents, but among the other coadjutors of the advertiser it does not appear. "Demonstrators" are too new as yet, and possibly their sex is a reason for the delay to organize. Window trimmers and commercial travelers are organized, the latter having been so for a long time.

Like every other group of people having a common interest those concerned in advertising have their journals, including newspapers covering the whole field and organs of special branches of the business. The oldest and largest in circulation is *Printers' Ink*, established in New York in 1888. It is a small, double column, 48 to 90-page weekly, containing interviews with practical advertisers, articles on various aspects of advertising, letters, news notes, editorials, a "department of criticism," and from ten to forty pages of newspaper and agency advertising. Being the oldest paper of the kind and very ably conducted, it maintains the leadership. It has a circulation of about 20,000 copies. It is said to have had over two hundred imitators, most of them short-

lived, and published by large advertisers, by "adwriters," or as adjuncts of advertising agencies. Some of them, however, are journals of real merit and of a high tone in their editorial discussions. Two or three are published in England, one in Bombay, and one in Melbourne. As far as ascertained there are none in France or Germany. Following is a list of forty-two, collected by the writer, all of which were in existence at last accounts:—

The Ad Book, San Francisco, Cal.

Adology, Detroit, Mich.

Ads, Louisville, Ky.

Ad Sense, Chicago, Ill.

The Advertiser, Cleveland, Ohio.

The Advertisers' Guide, New Market, N. J.

Advertising Experience, Chicago, Ill.

Advertising for Druggists, North Adams.

Mass.

The Advertising Man, New York.

Advertising Success, New York.

The Advertising World, Columbus, Ohio.

The Advisor, New York.

The Ad-Writer, St. Louis, Mo.

Agricultural Advertising, Chicago, Ill.

The Billboard, Cincinnati, Ohio.

The Billposter-Display Advertising, New York.

Boyce's Hustler, Chicago, Ill.

Brains, New York.

Class Advertising, New York.

Charles Austin Bates' Criticisms, New York.

Fame, New York.

General Information, Binghamton, N. Y.

Harman's Journal of Window Dressing, Chicago, Ill.

Ideas, New Haven, Conn.

The Imp, Lincoln, Neb.

Indentors' Guide, Bombay, India.

The Mail Order Journal, Chicago, Ill.

Mail Orders, New York.

The Middleman, Chicago, Ill.

The National Advertiser, New York.

Our Silent Partner, Waterville, Maine.

Plain Talk, Chicago, Ill.

Press and Printer, Boston, Mass.

Printers' Ink, New York.

Printers' Ink Supplement, London.

Profitable Advertising, Boston, Mass.

Publicity, Hull, England.

The Reporter, Chicago, Ill.

The Rhode Island Advertiser, Providence.

R. I.

The Show Window, Chicago, Ill.

Up-to-Date Distributor, Cleveland, Ohio.

The Western Advertiser, Omaha, Neb.

Besides these strictly trade journals, a considerable number of papers, especially commercial papers, conduct departments devoted to the subject, and occasionally a daily paper prints a series of articles written by an expert for the benefit of its advertisers.

The great extent to which the principle of the division of labor has been carried is one of the marked features of the advertising of the present day. The whole process has been minutely subdivided, so that each part of it, from the planning of the campaign to the placing of the advertisement in the hands of or before the eyes of the public, is performed

by a specialist. Following the development of these special organs we look to see them combined so that they will work together most economically. This stage has already been entered upon. It is a part of the general movement towards organization which is taking place in the social and political as well as in the economic world.

Large advertisers are combined in special and general associations. An example of the former is the "Proprietary Association of America," an organization of the patent and proprietary medicine makers. It has been in existence seventeen years, and has five hundred and fifty members. The "Sphinx Club" of New York is an organization of men in the advertising business or any of its allied interests,—agents or advertisers. Its purpose is general discussion of the problems of practical advertising. The "Association of American Advertisers" is a general organization, formed in New York in December, 1899. It consists of one representative and his alternate from any reputable house.

ADVERTISING IN FOREIGN COUNTRIES.

The character of Canadian advertising is influenced by the presence of the French element, and by English traditions and usages; but, on the whole, it is very much like that of the United States. The classes of goods advertised, the variety of mediums used and the relative importance of each, and the general style of the advertisements—language, display, illustration—are much the same as on this side of the line and tend to become still more so.

England was the pioneer in modern advertising. Some phases, as that of outdoor advertising, she passed through thirty years ahead of us; in others, such as newspaper display and illustration, she is far behind. In the amount of advertising *per capita* she ranks very nearly if not quite up with the United States. Outdoor signs, posters, etc., are used to an extent not yet reached here, and it is to be hoped

never will be reached. Cities, railway stations, and waysides are plastered with signs. Magazine advertising is a small affair compared with ours. Much of it is done by means of "insets"—loose sheets or folders placed between the leaves. Many of the British weeklies have huge circulations, and are well patronized by the advertisers. The dailies carry an immense amount of matter, but have not until recently admitted display type or cuts. Much less art is used in the presentation of the advertisement than with us. The bright, incisive, clean-cut style of our commercial paragraphers is wanting. Instead the Englishman says "use so and so," "wear so and so," "eat so and so," "they are the best"; and that exhausts his descriptive and persuasive powers.

French newspapers contain fewer advertisements than those of Germany, England, or the United States. The papers are very poorly printed on cheap paper and charge high rates. The *Petit Journal*, with a circulation of over a million a day, is the most famous; its rates are from four to six dollars a line. Cuts and display type are very poor. There are two important advertising agencies in Paris, one of which has exclusive contracts with a large number of newspapers and works in their interest, rather than in that of the advertiser.¹ The interiors of the omnibusses are used for placards much as our street cars are, and the interior walls of the omnibus stations are covered with posters. Advertising cabs, the sides of which are covered with posters, carry passengers in Paris for half fare. The railway stations are utilized for advertising, both inside and out, and along the lines leading from the cities are many billboards, as in England and America. France is the home of the poster. Billboards are numerous along the streets and boulevards, covered with striking posters done in brilliant colors, many of them of very high artistic merit.

According to all testimony advertising in Germany is much behind that in the United States.² Less energy and expense

¹ T. B. Russell, in *Printers' Ink*, December 14, 1898.

² *Consular Reports*, June, 1898, p. 251. Also, Fowler's *Publicity*, p. 136.

are put into it, and there are not so many large firms covering the whole country; more than that, the buying public is much smaller and has less money to spend. A German firm which advertises in both countries says that the so-called "great" style of Americans would not succeed in Germany.¹ In Leipsic, a typical city, the retail stores depend largely upon window display, many of the windows extending down to the basement floor for this purpose. Uniformity of price is noticeable, even after Christmas. There is no attempt at "wonderful bargains" or "cut prices." The principal street advertising is by small posters on large circular columns twelve feet high and four feet in diameter placed at intervals through the city in conspicuous positions. Newspaper advertising is the most important. It occupies about half the space in the dailies. In a paper taken at random thirty-six out of sixty-four columns were filled with advertisements. The matter is very compact. The street cars contain but few placards and they are on the ceiling. In the theatres permanent signs are placed above the stage setting. Opera and theatre programs are posted on the cylinders in type not much larger than ordinary newspaper type.² Exaggerated or untruthful advertisements are liable to punishment by law in Germany, and judges are not slow in applying the law. Sales because of "stock-taking," "removal," and "retiring from business," must be genuine or they lead to a fine.³

Advertising in the British colonies is much like that of England itself in character, but is scanty in its amount. The newspapers are poor in appearance and exclude cuts and display type even more strictly than the English papers do. A correspondent states that advertising in South Africa is small in quantity and poor in quality. The railway stations are used for enamel plates, painted boards, and occasional posters. There are no field signboards because few people

¹ *Fowler's Publicity*, p. 163.

² *Consular Reports*, June, 1898, p. 251.

³ *Ibid.*

travel. Billposting is done in the large towns. In the country there is very little advertising, even in the newspapers. Our correspondent states that those who wish to introduce a new article among the Dutch farmers bribe the "predicant," and the thing is mentioned in next Sunday's sermon!

Japan is taking on the usages of civilization in this respect as it is in every other. In eighteen years 575 daily and weekly newspapers have been established, besides many class papers.¹

ADVERTISING EXPENDITURE.

In describing the mediums and subjects of advertising we have given figures in many instances. We will now group together some of these for comparison, adding new ones also. The total advertising expenditure of the business countries of the world is estimated by Fowler to be over \$2,000,000,000 annually.² He does not explain how he arrives at this estimate, but presumably it is by taking the United States as a basis, and reckoning the probable relative amount in other countries. Estimates for the United States vary from \$200,000,000³ to \$500,000,000.⁴ The difference is partly accounted for by the lapse of time between the smaller and the larger estimate. Five years, and especially that five years, shows a vast increase in the amount of advertising in this country. But, as will be seen later, even this estimate does not take all the mediums into account.

For newspapers and periodicals Harris's estimate in 1893 was \$100,000,000. In 1897 Herzberg figured it at \$200,000,000;⁵ and in August, 1899, *Printers' Ink* made it between \$200,000,000 and \$300,000,000.

In billposting and other outdoor advertising Mr. R. J. Gunning places the expenditure for 1898 at \$50,000,000, of

¹ *Printers' Ink*, May 10, 1899.

² *Publicity*, p. 552.

³ E. P. Harris, *Social Economist*, March, 1893.

⁴ *Art in Advertising*, September, 1898.

⁵ *Lippincott's Magazine*, July, 1897.

which half a million was in Chicago.¹ In England the annual wages of billposter employees are reported by *Publicity*,² an advertising journal published at Hull, as amounting to \$7,500,000. Wages constitute perhaps one-half the total cost.

There are 750,000 store fronts in the United States fitted with plate glass windows to allow of the display of goods.³ One hundred dollars a year would seem to be a fair average of the cost per window, counting interest on the first cost, rental value of the floor space taken, loss on goods used for display, apparatus used, and value of time spent by proprietor, clerks, or professional window trimmer. This would give a total of \$75,000,000 a year for windows alone, to say nothing of display arrangements within the store.

Mr. George Kissam estimates the annual expenditure for street car advertising at \$2,000,000, and this is concurred in by other authorities.⁴ For occasional literature and miscellaneous mediums no authoritative estimates or data are in our possession.

Under the head of personal mediums the cost of commercial travelers is the main item. The president of the commercial travelers' national league says that there are, or were until recently, 350,000 of the craft in the United States.⁵ Taking the average annual cost of a commercial traveler as \$2000 this gives a total of \$700,000,000. As the traveler performs two functions — advertising and selling — one-half of this immense sum may be charged to each. Evidently it does not enter into the computations of total expenditure given above. Were it included it would increase the largest figures by three-fourths.

But it is relative and not absolute amounts which are most instructive and most important. What ratio does advertis-

¹ *Printers' Ink*, July 19, 1899.

² *Publicity*, August–September, 1899.

³ *Brains*, October 21, 1899.

⁴ *Printers' Ink*, August 24, 1898.

⁵ Before the Industrial Commission, June 16, 1899.

ing expenditure bear to the value of goods sold? To this question there is no reliable answer. But, taking the value of goods sold in the United States in 1890 at \$10,000,000,000, and the total expenditure for advertising them at \$500,000,000, we get a rate of five per cent. This is not an overestimate.

We will now give a number of individual cases where the ratio is known. A western flour miller spent about \$18,000 in advertising a total output of goods which sold for \$2,700,000, making a rate of two-thirds of one per cent.¹ A Chicago mail order house spends half a million a year in advertising and sells \$15,000,000 worth of goods,—a rate of three and one-third per cent.² The case of the Monarch bicycle has already been cited. Its expenditure was from four to five per cent of its sales. The *Dry Goods Economist*³ says that “two and a half per cent is regarded by many merchants as the ideal advertising appropriation, while others who base their success upon most extensive advertising do not consider five per cent too much.” Mr. Charles F. Jones, who has every facility for making a fair estimate, thinks that the advertising of the twenty large New York department stores averages about four per cent. Their sales are about \$50,000,000 a year, and their advertising expenditure about \$2,000,000.⁴ A western flour and feed mill firm figures that each inquiry in response to their advertisement costs eighty-seven cents,⁵ and there is only one sale out of twenty inquiries, on the average. This makes the advertising on each mill cost \$17.40, and as the mill sells for from one hundred to two hundred dollars the rate varies from eight and a half to seventeen per cent. A certain cereal food sells for ten cents a package, or \$3.60 for a case of thirty-six packages. About one dollar of this is due to the cost of advertising it,

¹ *Printers' Ink*, January 4, 1899.

² *Ibid.*, December 14, 1898.

³ Cited in *Printers' Ink*, May 10, 1899.

⁴ *Ibid.*, January 25, 1899.

⁵ *Ibid.*, June 14, 1899.

or twenty-eight per cent.¹ A well-known proprietary article was advertised to the extent of \$429,000 in 1893, and its sale amounted about \$1,500,000, giving a rate of over twenty-eight per cent.² Another medicine firm spent \$250,000 in 1898 to sell \$1,500,000 worth of medicine, or over sixteen per cent.³ One firm spends five per cent on some articles and twenty-five on others. Another medicine firm says that on some articles from thirty to forty per cent of gross sales is expended.⁴ Cahill's "Advertising"⁵ says that in many businesses it has paid to spend in advertising two-thirds of the capital invested; and A. T. Stewart said that he who had invested one dollar in a business should invest a dollar in advertising that business.⁶

That some firms can afford to spend almost any percentage necessary will appear from the following facts: In 1895 the Michigan food commissioner showed that one article which sold for fifteen cents cost one-third of a cent to make.⁷ A certain household article which retails for ten cents costs the dealer less than two cents.⁸ Some proprietary medicines very extensively advertised and used sell for seventy-five cents and one dollar and cost from four to six cents to manufacture.⁹

We cannot show statistically what percentage advertising forms of the value of the goods when they reach the hands of the consumer. The estimate of five per cent given above is thrown out only as an estimate. It was made quite independently of the figures given for individual advertisers. Four per cent seems to be a common rate among retailers,

¹ Charles L. Coleman, *Printers' Ink*, September 25, 1898.

² W. J. Lampton, in *Fame*, cited by *Printers' Ink*, November 29, 1899.

³ John C. Graham, in *Printers' Ink*, February 15, 1898.

⁴ Fowler, p. 126.

⁵ Page 8.

⁶ *Ibid.*

⁷ *Vermontville* (Mich.) *Echo*, February 26, 1896.

⁸ *Printers' Ink*, March 15, 1899.

⁹ *Bulletin of Pharmacy*, quoted in *Advertising for Druggists*, June, 1899.

but it must be remembered that many of their goods have been advertised one or more times before, and that the advertising done by commercial travelers all comes before the retailer gets the goods. As for the general advertisers, they spend varying percentages, all the way up to one-half their gross income, and occasionally even more.

The question now arises, "What part of this expenditure is an economic waste?" A considerable portion of it, surely. In the first place, much of that advertising which merely results in drawing trade to one seller at the expense of others must be put down as sheer waste. A case in point is the enormous advertising of coffee by the Arbuckles and the Woolson Spice Company in their rivalry. If the consumption of coffee is somewhat stimulated thereby, it is at the expense of tea or some other beverage. Coffee is already universally known and used; the public does not need educating on the subject. Another case is that of soap. In the summer of 1899, when the attempt was being made to form a soap trust, the promoters stated that \$30,000,000 was annually thrown away in advertising soap. This was probably an exaggeration, but we have the statement of a conservative manufacturer that he would not consider a half of that sum too large an estimate of the waste.

The advertising springing from the rivalry of two or more retail stores in the same locality is another example. For the information of the public one advertisement would be as good as three or four. The rest are simply wasted. The labor of the great army of commercial travelers is in large part without economic value to society. A fraction of their present numbers would do the work they all now do, both in making known the existence and qualities of goods and in effecting sales. In this one point alone there is probably a waste of at least a hundred million dollars annually. Again, there is the advertising of many patent medicines, which

operates chiefly to make people fancy that they need medicine. It simply plays upon the ignorance and credulity of the public. Were it to drop off altogether the economic condition of society would be improved by just the amount now spent upon it. Moreover, a considerable portion of what may, under existing conditions, be called legitimate and necessary advertising fails to reach the mark. A large general advertiser said that he made one mistake in advertising in 1898-99 which cost him \$50,000.¹ Assuming for the moment that the use of his goods would have resulted in a gain to society, some \$50,000 spent by him had failed to induce people to buy those goods. It was lost to him and to society. None but those in the business realize how much is annually wasted in this way. One large advertiser says that is seventy-five per cent of the whole expenditure; another authority says it is ninety per cent.²

Further illustrations might be given but are perhaps unnecessary. Let it be understood that advertising has a legitimate function, namely, to make known the qualities of goods and the conditions upon which they may be had, as a preliminary and necessary condition of their being distributed among the people. But when it is used to introduce or increase the sale of an injurious or worthless article; when it influences the public to an undue expenditure upon a good article; when its volume goes beyond what is necessary to inform the public; and when it serves merely to divert existing demand into particular private channels — in all these cases, and they constitute a large part of the total, advertising is an economic waste. Can this waste be prevented? Some light is thrown upon the question by the great industrial combinations.

The two combinations which have longest been prominent — the Standard Oil Company and the American Sugar

¹ *Profitable Advertising*, December, 1899, p. 477.

² Fowler, p. 196.

Refining Company — have done practically no advertising. The latter has, however, recently taken it up as a result of the competition of independent refineries, and the former for the purpose of pushing certain of its by-products. Many of those lately formed have cut very deeply into one form of advertising — that of commercial travelers. The president of their national league testified before the Industrial Commission on June 16, 1899, that the trusts had up to that time discharged 35,000 men, and reduced the salaries of 25,000 more, entailing upon them a loss of \$60,000,000 a year, which was saved to the trusts, as was also \$21,000,000 railroad fare and \$27,000,000 in hotel bills. He stated that there had been discharged by the tobacco combines 3000 men; by the bicycle combine 600 men; chair, 500; rubber, 300; sugar and coffee, 1000; steel rod, 300; baking powder, all but six; tin plate, nine out of every ten. Whether these figures prove to be accurate or not, economy in this form of advertising is one of the main motives and first steps of the combinations. The saving is an immense one.

Are the trusts able to make similar savings in other forms of advertising? The best opinion seems to be that, while a considerable saving can be made, it will not be as large as in the case of commercial travelers. In the first place their monopoly is not absolute. In many cases independent producers still compete with them, and in order to keep their share of the trade they must continue advertising. In other cases competition, although not actual, is at hand as a possibility whenever an opening presents itself. The trust must cover the field continuously in order to prevent such an opening. Moreover, even if the trust had a complete and safe monopoly it would generally be to its advantage to continue, and often to increase its advertising expenditure.

The truth is that human wants are elastic. They quickly expand under the right conditions and contract when pres-

sure is exerted upon them. In this fact lie our hope of progress and our safety in times of depression. None are so keenly alive to the fact as the general advertisers. Many are the instances in which the demand for new goods or for a particular brand of old goods has been built up from nothing by continuous advertising. The advertiser cultivates wants.

It is safe to say that in the case of most goods now generally advertised, and of most houses which advertise either locally or generally, the sales would fall off to a ruinous extent were the advertising withdrawn. Now while it is true that some trusts have withdrawn a part of their advertising, those businesses which have been built up on it must continue. The baking powder trust, for example, cannot discontinue the advertising of the "Royal" or "Cleveland" brands. Were they to do so the independent companies would seize the opportunity to push forward their products. Furthermore, the trust being capitalized on the combined capital of all the companies forming it, at the least, and this value depending in each case on the advertising which had built it up, it is evident that that advertising must continue if the revenue from the sale of the several brands is to continue. Of course it may be a part of the purpose of the trust to drop the brands of the smaller component companies and substitute the two or three better known ones for them. In this case they can be only partly successful, for the independent companies are at hand again.

The only mediums besides the commercial travelers to feel severely the effects of the withdrawal of advertising by the trusts have been the trade papers. The *Chicago Tribune* is authority for the statement that the failure of three or four of them is directly traceable to the formation of trusts in their industries, and the consequent cessation of advertising by the smaller concerns swallowed up.

The department stores throw some light on this question, for they are similar in their nature to trusts. They find it necessary to advertise against actual and possible competition, and they find it profitable also. Their advertising stimulates buying. It draws crowds in every city. It is the most striking feature of the daily papers, and its volume is undoubtedly much greater than that of the hundreds of little stores would have been, had they remained independent. On the whole, therefore, it does not seem probable that advertising will be much if at all reduced as a result of the trust movement.

Fuller treatment of the economic side of our subject and the discussion of its psychology, its esthetic and its ethical aspects, are not permitted by the limits of this article, and are reserved for other papers.

BIBLIOGRAPHY.

BOOKS.

- History of Advertising.* By Henry Sampson. London, 1873.
The History of Signboards. By Jacob Larwood and John C. Hotten. London, 1866.
Publicity: an Encyclopedia of Advertising. By N. C. Fowler, Jr. New York, 1897.
Publicity. By an adept of thirty years' experience. London, 1878.
Quaint and Curious Advertisements. By Henry M. Brooks. Boston, 1886.
 For books bearing upon special phases of advertising see footnotes.

ARTICLES IN MAGAZINES.

- Advance of Advertising. *Cornhill*, vol. 72: 505.
 Advertisements. By A. Wynter. *Quarterly Review*, vol. 97: 195.
 Advertisements of the 18th Century. *Leisure Hour*, vol. 31: 408.
 Advertisers and Advertisements. *All the Year Round*, vol. 41: 34.
 Advertisements and their Disappointment. *Temple Bar*, vol. 11: 551.
 Advertising. By G. Wakeman. *Galaxy*, vol. 3: 202.
 Advertising Age of Veneer. *Fraser*, vol. 45: 87.
 Advertising as an Art. *Chambers' Journal*, vol. 2: 401.
 Advertising as a Trespass on the Public. By Richardson Evans. *19th Century*, vol. 37: 968.

- Advertising Duties. *Littell's Living Age*, vol. 31 : 27.
- Advertising and Art. By G. P. Lathrop. *Nation*, vol. 20 : 342.
- Advertising for a Wife. *Colburn*, vol. 82 : 289 and 442.
- Advertising in China. *Cornhill*, vol. 64 : 25.
- Advertising in New York. (1874.) *All the Year Round*, vol. 32 : 425.
- Advertising in Scotland. *Tait* (n. s.), vol. 3 : 190.
- The Advertising Nuisance. By W. E. H. Lecky and others. *New Review*, vol. 9 : 466.
- Advertising Literature of the Age. *Colburn*, vol. 67 : 111.
- Advertising of the "Times." *Chambers'*, vol. 3 : 199.
- The Advertising Page. *Overland* (n. s.), vol. 22 : 569.
- Advertising, the Grand Farce. *Fraser*, vol. 79 : 380.
- Advertising Traps. (1859.) By Charles Dickens. *All the Year Round*, vol. 1 : 5, 251.
- Advertising System. *Edinburgh Review*, vol. 77 : 1.
- Among the Advertisements. *All the Year Round*, vol. 34 : 485.
- Among the Advertisements. *Chambers'*, vol. 61 : 84.
- Architecture and Advertisements. By Richardson Evans. *Journal of the Society of Arts*, vol. 42 : 35.
- Art in Advertising. *Art Journal*, vol. 59 : 49.
- Artistic Advertising. *Magazine of Art*, vol. 12 : 421.
- Art of Advertising. *Every Saturday*, vol. 5 : 732.
- The Art of Puffing. *Dublin Review*, vol. 27 : 146.
- The Art of Successful Advertising. *Engineering Magazine*, vol. 6 : 229.
- The Arts of Advertising. *Leisure Hour*, vol. 15 : 635.
- Curious Advertisements. *Chambers' Journal*, vol. 56 : 678; and 59 : 399.
- Curiosities of Advertising. *Chambers'*, vol. 72 : 311.
- Curiosities of Advertising. By W. H. Rideing. *Scribner's*, vol. 20 : 601.
- Curiosities of Advertising. *Leisure Hour*, vol. 10 : 797.
- Deceptive Advertisements. *Chambers'*, vol. 54 : 70.
- Drolleries in Advertising. " vol. 55 : 551.
- Early Newspaper Advertising. " vol. 9 : 158.
- Economics of Advertising. By E. P. Harris. *Social Economist*, vol. 4 : 171.
- Evolution of Newspaper Advertising. *Lippincott's*, vol. 60 : 107.
- Financial Advertising. By J. B. Hodgskin. *The Nation*, vol. 9 : 186.
- German Advertisements. *Chambers'*, vol. 48 : 219.
- Hints to Advertisers. " vol. 36 : 161.
- Modern Advertisements. *Dublin University Magazine*, vol. 49 : 456.
- Modern Advertisements. *Victoria*, vol. 6 : 313.
- Newspaper Advertising. By J. J. Belcher. *Harper's*, vol. 33 : 781.
- Only the Advertisements. By E. Stuart. *Temple Bar*, vol. 106 : 221.
- Philosophy of Advertising. *Once a Week*, vol. 9 : 163.
- Picture Advertising in South America. *Household Words*, vol. 4 : 494.
- A Plea for Truth in Advertising. *Fraser*, vol. 62 : 108.

Puffing. *London Magazine*, vol. 1 : 657.

The Puffing Element in American Literature. By E. I. Sears. *National Quarterly Review*, vol. 26 : 42.

Puffing in our Higher Education. By E. I. Sears. *National Quarterly Review*, vol. 31 : 281

The Puffing System. By T. B. Macaulay. *Edinburgh Review*, vol. 51 : 193.

Queer Advertisements. *Chambers'*, vol. 43 : 210; and 44 : 488.

Sensational Advertising. *Leisure Hour*, vol. 11 : 102.

Some Odd Advertisements. *Chambers'*, vol. 64 : 91.

Some Old Advertisements. " vol. 43 : 506.

Thoughts on Puffing. *All the Year Round*, vol. 25 : 329.